

Comments on:
“Herbal Magic’s Claims regarding the efficacy of WM2000 are supported by clinical evidence”

It’s important when considering research to look at what the studies are setting out to prove, their methodologies and the claims being made about them.

Looking at these studies I’m struck by a few things. Many are simply proof of concept studies meaning they’re studies being conducted on cell lines or animal models that while they might suggest a potential mechanism of action for an ingredient on weight loss, don’t actually test whether or not that ingredient has an effect on weight loss in humans. Others suffer from methodological issues of very small sample sizes, very unique populations, non-overweight subjects, or poorly matched control groups. Some are just random stretches. For instance three of the papers have to do with the fact that iodine is involved in thyroid function and that thyroid hormones are involved in body weight and metabolism. While indeed that’s true, suggesting that supplementing iodine will impact on thyroid function to affect weight loss would be comparable to pointing out that glucose is involved in brain activity and that eating chocolate bars would therefore make you smarter.

Perhaps the most interesting papers are the ones which themselves speak to the lack of efficacy of hydroxycitric acid in weight management. One paper states, “*Hydroxycitric acid might not primarily be a weight loss agent*”ⁱ while the other concluded, “*the active treatment group did not exhibit better dietary compliance or significant correlations between appetitive variables and energy intake or weight change. This study does not support a satiety effect of hydroxycitric acid*”.ⁱⁱ Odd to include papers that disprove your claims as proof for your claims.

Bottom line? People are not simply large mice, you can’t draw real conclusions based on very small sample sizes, if control groups don’t match your research is rather worthless and just because you’ve got a potential mechanism all worked out doesn’t mean that in real life, with real people, it’ll work according to plan.

ⁱ (a) Westerterp-Plantenga, Kovaks. The effects of (-) hydroxycitrate on energy intake and satiety in overweight humans. The international Journal of Obesity, 2002.

ⁱⁱ (g) Mattes, Bormann. Effects of (-) hydroxycitrate on appetite variables. Physiology and Behaviour 2000.